



# **3<sup>RD</sup> BIENNIAL NATIONAL CONFERENCE**

**DEPARTMENT OF URBAN AND REGIONAL PLANNING  
SCHOOL OF ENVIRONMENTAL TECHNOLOGY  
FEDERAL UNIVERSITY OF TECHNOLOGY, MINNA**



*Book Of*  
**CONFERENCE PROCEEDINGS**

*Theme:*  
**URBAN SECURITY: THREATS,  
REALITIES AND SOLUTIONS**

Date: 13<sup>TH</sup> – 15<sup>TH</sup> August, 2008

*EDITOR -IN -CHIEF:*  
**DR. A. M JINADU**

## SLUM TRANSFORMATION FOR URBAN SECURITY: A CASE STUDY OF IKIRIKE RENEWAL SCHEME IN ENUGU METROPOLIS

Ohadugha Chukwudi B.

Dept of Urban and Regional Planning  
Federal University Technology, Minna.  
E-mail: ayichucks@yahoo.com

### Abstract

*The insecurity and general living conditions in slums require public attention. This attention is towards improving the areas generally. Insecurity (fire, health and crime wise), infrastructural inadequacy, overcrowding, substandard buildings, etc are the major problems manifesting in the socio-physical and economic conditions of the study area. The aim of this paper is to propose a renewal scheme for the study area through the assessment and analysis of physical environment, quantity and quality of housing, availability and adequacy of infrastructural facilities and socio-economic characteristics of the inhabitants. Stratified random sampling was adopted using the three wards making up the area as the strata. The paper examined the three basic renewal strategies namely; comprehensive redevelopment, rehabilitation and conservation. After their evaluation which was based on social benefits and security, having long term effects, comprehensive redevelopment strategy was chosen as a solution to the deteriorated and insecure study area. This paper recommends strongly public enlightenment and participation likewise phasing of the scheme to ameliorate the anticipated reaction and negative effects on the populace. Finally, the paper concludes that if the renewal scheme is properly implemented, it would not only enhance the general security of the area, but also to a large extent, will help to uplift the socio-economic status of the people as well as make the neighborhood environment more habitable and safe.*

**KEYWORDS:** Security, Implementation, Renewal, Transformation.

### 1.0 Introduction

A community, be it rural or urban, is an ecological unit. It grows and in the process, parts become obsolete due to old age, misuse or lack of care and without regenerative action, such parts decay and fall into dis-use (Onibokun, 1985). In addition, urban living devoid of adequate

security and safety of life and property sets in. This fact is evident in our cities and towns. As new estates and neighborhoods emerge, the older ones exhibit evidence of decay and lack of general security which is referred to as "slum". This slum development with its implications can be seen as a direct consequence of the declining housing stock, both qualitatively and quantitatively. The solution to the Nigerian housing and residential environmental problems therefore involves more than the construction of new housing units or new estates or neighbourhoods. It requires the renewal and gentrification of some of the existing deteriorating ones with adequate facilities and services needed for a good, safe and secured urban living.

Urban security is the quality or condition of being free from danger, injury or damage. It is a state of protection against debilitating life-threatening events. In urban areas, such threats can come from the following: environmental hazards, disasters, interpersonal violence and social delinquency. Most if not all are features of slum areas.

The concept of urban renewal could be traced back to Europe during the industrial revolution when a lot of people migrated from the rural areas to urban areas to seek employment. This trend of rural-urban migration resulted in the high rate of urbanization today in most countries and Nigeria in particular. The actual problem of Nigerian urban growth and development is not strictly its urbanization rate which the World Bank has described as "astonishing". Rather the general concern has always been expressed about its consequences which include lack of adequate infrastructure and which consequently create bottlenecks for economic expansion, a situation where government can't cope with the growing demand for basic urban services. Such consequences have been known to have manifested as urban slums, deficient and ineffective urban infrastructure. According to World Bank et al (1995), "the physical condition of Nigerian urban infrastructure - water supply, urban roads, electricity, drainage, waste disposal, is generally poor..."

Other consequences include; worsening traffic condition, housing shortage, insecurity, urban poverty, violence and hide-out for miscreants. With all these problems associated with urban slums, the goals and objectives of a planned, safe, secure and healthy environment have therefore



been negated. Agbola, (1986) noted that most of the areas calling for renewal action in Nigeria are not only the core of Nigerian traditional cities but also the fringes of most urban areas which are the new slums.

It is in this view that this paper also attempts to bridge the gap between spatial exhaustion and availability of slums, as it tends to direct both public and government attentions towards protecting against further development of slum features in the vacant land while carrying out the renewal strategy to be adopted. The paper focuses on assessing the physical condition of the study area, determining the quantity and quality of housing in Ikinke, assessing the availability and conditions of infrastructure in the area, suggesting ways of ensuring security of life and property and improving the socio-economic life of the inhabitants of the study area.

## **2.0 Theoretical Framework**

### **2.1 Urban Renewal**

Urban renewal conceptually implies bringing back a deteriorated urban area to the status of the original intentions of a safe, aesthetic and functionally efficient urban area. The term "Urban Renewal" was coined by an American Housing economist, Miles Colean in his attempt to adopt an integrated approach to curb the threats of urban living, especially that of eliminating slums. Urban renewal was developed as an integrated approach to combat the deterioration of the urban environment at a time (1960's) when there was a growing impression in many countries that a limited approach to obsolescence and deterioration was inadequate and in the long run, would not solve the problem. A lot of scholars defined urban renewal differently but conceptually they imply the transformation of a deteriorated area for safe urban living.

### **2.2 Urban Renewal Strategies**

These are programmes set up to carry out the renewal in an orderly manner that will avoid untold hardship on the inhabitants of the affected area. Urban renewal strategies also involve adopting

an urban scheme that will preserve, conserve and gentrify existing natural and man-made features of the renewal area.

There are 3 techniques used to package urban renewal strategies. Two are major techniques viz redevelopment, which incorporates slum clearance, and rehabilitation or renovation. The 3<sup>rd</sup> technique, conservation is very common in Europe. It is a common place for people to give different terminologies to these techniques like incomplete redevelopment which leads to controversies. However, the basic meaning of the techniques ultimately remains the same. A combination of their application, which depends on the model of the urban problems to be solved, constitutes the renewal strategy.

### **2.2.1 Redevelopment Strategy**

Redevelopment can be applied to a single structure (blight) or to a cluster of structures (slum) where obsolescence or decay is absolute, which is where the structure or layout is in a serious deteriorated condition. It is pertinent to note here that blight begets slum. Slum clearance should not be done if the minimum housing needs are not met. An example is the resettlement scheme embarked on in the 1960's in New Bussa, Niger State as a result of the Dam construction. The socio-cultural and eco-political characteristics and needs of the displaced people were not considered before embarking on the scheme. Consequent to this, the resettled people had to revert to their former slum kind of life and culture indicating the failure of the intentions of the scheme.

### **2.2.2 Rehabilitation Strategy**

Rehabilitation is the process of neighborhood revitalization through the removal of the worst houses, the repairing and construction of streets, and the addition of parks and other public utilities. It is applied in areas where buildings, though generally structurally sound, are partially

deteriorated, in which some loss of original functions are being felt, or where conditions might lead to these.

### **2.2.3 Conservation Strategy**

Conservation is closely associated with rehabilitation because both are concerned with the preservation and maintenance of valuable elements in the old environment. Conservation is predominantly concerned with preserving items with historic, cultural, aesthetic and architectural value. It prevents deterioration by, amongst other things, requiring maintenance of buildings, preventing over crowding, enforcing density limitations and zoning regulations.

### **3.0 Research Methodology**

A survey of the area involving oral interview, questionnaire and reconnaissance methods was carried out. It revealed the existence of 3 wards (A,B,C) which were used as the strata for the stratified sampling method adopted. 300 questionnaires; 100 for each ward representing about 10% of the total population of the area was administered randomly within each ward. It revealed information on socio-economic characteristics and attitudinal issues of the inhabitants, housing stock both qualitatively and quantitatively, building characteristics and facilities, adequacy and availability of infrastructure, services, etc. 250 questionnaires (90.7%) were completely filled and returned and was used as the adopted sample size. Tables and Plates were used in the analysis of the findings.

### **4.0 Study Area.**

Ikirike is located in the periphery of Idaw river layout in Enugu. The original owners are the Ikirike community which consists of 3 kindred from Amagu-ugwu Anechi town in Enugu south L.G.A of Enugu state though the inhabitants are both the indigenes and non-indigenes. The population of the area could not be ascertained because it was incorporated in the Idaw River layout population by 1991 census as shown in Appendix 1.

Efforts were made to estimate the study area's population by using the total number of household and house occupancy ratio. At the time of survey in 2005, the estimated population of Ikirike was approximately 3,250. The assumption is that the structure of the population from the sample generally reflects the total population of Ikirike.

#### 4.1 Population Projection of Ikirike

In a renewal scheme of this nature, it is pertinent to make forecast for future development tendencies. This is done by making future projections using statistical/mathematical models. As already estimated, the 2005 population of Ikirike is 3,250 and using the growth rate of 2.9%, the 2005 population projection of Ikirike to year 2025 (20 years) is 5,753.

#### 5.0 Data Presentation and Discussion of Result

Table 1 below, shows that 56% of the inhabitants are income earners of not more than ₦4000 per month. Also from the survey, 72.4% are directly or indirectly single while 0.8% are 1<sup>st</sup> degree holders. The implication of these is that greater numbers of the inhabitants are relatively poor and invariably constitutes nuisance and threat to good and safe urban living. According to Rotherberg 1967, slum area inhabitants are caught in a vicious cycle of poverty.

Table 1: Employment – Income Class

Employment Income class	Private worker	Public worker	Self employed	Student	Unemployed	Total	Percentage
₦500-1000	12	-	4	-	-	16	11.43
₦1001-2000	4	16	59	-	-	79	56.43
₦2001-3000	-	3	37	-	-	40	28.57
₦3001-4000	-	2	3	-	-	5	3.57
₦4001+	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Total	16	21	103	-	-	140	100.00

Source: Author's Field Survey, 2005



For occupancy ratio, about half (50.4%) of the sample population live in 2 room apartment (see table 2). Most of the inhabitants are indigenes of Enugu State representing 74.8%.

**Table 2: Relationship of family size and number of rooms occupied**

No of rooms occupied	1	2	3	4	5+	Total	Percentage (%)
Family size							
1-5	68	41	18	6	-	133	53.2
6-10	14	85	11	4	3	117	46.8
11-15	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
16-20	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
21+	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Total	82	126	29	10	3	250	100.00

Source: Author's Field Survey, 2005

Out of the 116 buildings sampled, 83 (71.6%) are between 16-20 years old (table 3). About 64.7% of the buildings have between 6-10 rooms. Plate 1 shows a typical obsolete structure in the study area.

**Table 3: Age of Dwelling Unit**

Age Group	No. of Dwelling Unit	(%) Percentage of the total Dwelling Units
1-5	-	0
6-10	2	1.7
11-15	7	6.0
16-20	83	71.6
21+	24	20.7
Total	116	100.0

Source: Author's Field Survey, 2005





Plate 1: Obsolete structure

For the urban roads, about 92.2% of the motor able roads are surfaced and are in a deplorable condition (Plate 2), while many of the structures closely and haphazardly sited. Greater percentage of the houses sampled was built with substandard and makeshift materials which are combustible and prone to fire outbreak (Plate 3) leaving about 2.6% that were built with sandcrete blocks.



Plate 2: Unsurfaced road



Plate 3: Make shift structure.

For personal conveniences, 59.3% defecate in the bush, 2.4% uses modern WC while 38.3% uses either bucket or pit latrine. Health wise, in the outbreak of epidemics, greater number of the inhabitants will be affected. Also, many have their bathrooms completely detached away from the dwelling places and with substandard materials. (Plate 4).



Plate 4: Bathroom away from dwelling unit



Plate 5: Bad roof condition

On attitudinal issue, most respondents dislike the area on the following grounds: physical condition, low income earners zone, lack of basic facilities (power supply, water supply, drainage) high level of insecurity against both natural and man made disasters, hide out for criminals and prostitutes, etc. 3.7% prefers staying back even if their income increases because of the following reasons: serenity of the area, farming opportunities; existing harmonious communal life and fraternity there; unattractive to robbers; rural nature of the area.

Conclusively, the field survey revealed that about 96% of the buildings has deteriorated badly or are obsolete (Plates 1). In some parts, buildings of bad roof and wall conditions and shanties erupt in a most confused manner with no defined pattern, no observance of setbacks, etc. (Plate 5). At this juncture, it is pertinent to point out that during fire outbreak, the magnitude and extent of damages/loss will be much if buildings are clustered together without adherence to setback standards. Setbacks ensure proper ventilation and air circulation, reduces spread in times of fire outbreak, etc.



## 6.0 Criteria Assessment for Renewal Strategy

The result of the analysis will help to adopt or propose the best idea that will help to transform the deteriorated study area. In the theoretical frame work, the major renewal strategies were highlighted. It is now pertinent to consider and evaluate them for the proposed area. Any of these major urban renewal strategies; redevelopment, rehabilitation, and conservation can be chosen to transform the slum into a habitable status though the choice of any of them depends on the outcome of their evaluation. In the choice of the alternative strategy, some factors are considered which includes:

- (i) **The existing physical condition of the area.** The existing situation basically considered were data on housing, nature of the existing roads, and the availability of community facilities in the area. See Map 1
- (ii) **Cost implications.** The development of the alternative urban renewal strategy will depend immensel on the cost involved in using the said strategy. Hence, any strategy chosen should take into account the cost involvement.
- (iii) **Security and Social benefits.** Any strategy chosen should possess such qualities capable of alleviating the sufferings of the inhabitants, raise their standard of living and facilitates safe habitation and security of life and property. Therefore in developing any strategy for the area, it is important to weigh the security and social benefits inherent in the alternative strategy. These will therefore influence the preferred strategy since it will be of a long term benefit.



MAP 1: Existing Situation Map of Ikirike



Source: Author, 2005

## 6.1 Evaluation of Strategies for Adoption

Having established the various alternative strategies, their merits/demerits and gains/losses will be compared based on security and social benefits. Evaluation is intended to assist the decision maker in making rational choice of the alternative strategy. The evaluation is in respect to the study area situations.

### 6.1.1 Alternative A: Comprehensive redevelopment

This includes rehabilitation, spot clearance, and conservation. It involves clearance of the whole area in installments leaving out or upgrading the few preserved features. About 96% of the dwellings in Ikirike are in real obsolescent condition and the best option for them is clearance. Basically, this strategy is usually adopted where the existing buildings are of little or no value, upgrading will be too expensive, and nothing of value to be preserved. Installmental clearance is suggested so that its adverse effect will be drastically reduced.

**Merits** - The inhabitants will be upgraded to the status of house owners. That social stigma of "never do well" and perpetual urban poor will be dealt with through re-housing programmes. Most importantly is the inclusion of police beats and fire posts in the scheme. Lastly, the positive changes will be to the satisfaction of everybody.

**Demerits**- Displacement of families is done quite unsatisfactorily resulting in the merging together of incompatible elements in the new area. There is a complete disruption of economic activities and social insecurity as to the uncertainty of tenure. There is also the usual problem of adaptation to the new area and lastly, it usually expensive to undertake.

#### **6.1.2 Alternative B: Rehabilitation**

According to Onibokun (1980), it is a process of environmental improvement at both micro and macro levels utilizing in an effective way all the domestic resources and all the possible strategies initially deployed. On the micro level, rehabilitation is basically on individual housing units where defective structural components of buildings are repaired. On the macro level, the neighborhood is revitalized by the renewal of obsolescent houses, construction of new roads, etc.

**Merits** - In this strategy, cost is reduced. Socio-economic ties of the inhabitants are unaffected since no complete disruption will occur. Social security is maintained

**Demerits** - In the short run, degradation sets in since the totality of the area is not considered; it does culture the people towards the environment

#### **6.1.3 Alternative C: Conservation**

This strategy is concerned with the preservation and maintenance of features of value in an area where renewal is being carried out. In this light, the features to be conserved in Ikirike are few

selectively list houses and some roads (Map 1). Apart from these, every other development here is worth demolishing.

**Merits** - This strategy is cost-effective since some features are preserved. These preserved features can be tourist attractions and destinations. The culture of the area is not lost totally.

**Demerits** - The preserved or conserved features, if not upgraded might reduce the aesthetical quality of the environment. The maintenance cost of such features may be too high.

Conclusively, from the social evaluation of these alternative strategies and the extent of their effects, it is clear that alternative A (complete redevelopment incorporating rehabilitation and conservation) is favored. This is so because of the long term benefits (social and security wise) it has over the others with respect to the study area. Hence, alternative A is chosen.

#### 7.1 Redevelopment Plan Proposal

This is a general detail plan of the proposed renewal of the area. Housing, circulation pattern, security, public utilities and services, educational and health facilities and the socio-economic activities of the inhabitants among others were considered in transforming the area. See Map 2.

MAP 2: Proposed Layout Plan for Birke



Source: Author, 2015

## 8.0 Implication of the Proposed Renewal Scheme

The implications of this scheme includes, inter alia, untold hardships on the inhabitants, loss of properties and social ties, compulsory acquisition of land etc. However, some of the implications will be taken care of by providing alternative place for displaced people.

## 9.0 Implementation of the Proposed Plan

As a result of the implications, the implementation of the renewal strategy will be phased to reduce the costs and the degree of the inconveniences that might be inflicted on the inhabitants if the project is carried out wholesomely. The implementation programmes are divided into 4 phases of 3 year period each as thus:

**Phase I (2008-2010):** Evaluation of the private property values, payment of compensations where necessary, arrangements for temporal resettlement of the affected people, opening up of new roads and demolition of encroaching structures, upgrading of retained roads, provision of public utility lines, mains and concrete drainage channels before road tarring.

**Phase II (2011-2013):** Resettlement of half of the affected people, demolition of their affected structures and the immediate building of new houses where government has to provide loans and sites and services. Also to be done is the construction of public services and facilities.

**Phase III (2014-2016):** Resettlement of the rest displaced people and demolitions as in Phase II. Recalling of the 1<sup>st</sup> set of the displaced to the completed structures, construction of service industries and commercial areas.



**Phase Iv (2017-2019):** Recalling of the second set of the displaced as in Phase III, supply of equipment, staff to the facilities and services, setting up of an administrative body to take care of the neighborhood and modalities for acquiring vacant plots.

## 10 Conclusion

After studying the entire conditions of the study area and analysis of findings done, it is hoped that after the implementation of this renewal programme, it will ensure adequate security of lives and properties, preserve the environment and improve the socio-economic conditions of the people.

## 11. Recommendation

- Urban renewal is a delicate issue and must be attacked with great caution. Attempt to resettle people had toppled some governments.
- It should be done when housing shortage had eased or when it is coupled with vast rehousing programme.
- Adequate compensation for moving and other expenses as well as for losses of goodwill should be provided as part of the renewal costs.
- It should be undertaken only after its benefits (long term) to the community as a whole justify the impositions it enforces and it should be launched only after it has received wide public acceptance.
- Encourage the police to re-introduce the system of police beats in urban centers as a means of saturating them with their presence.
- Both the Police and Fire fighters should be equipped and motivated to combat any unwanted occurrence of crime and fire mishaps respectively
- Encourage the system of neighborhood watch or "banger" as it is called in northern Nigeria.

## Reference

- Federal Republic of Nig. (2002), Government White Paper on the Report of the Presidential Committee on Urban Development and Housing
- Ohadugha, C. B. (1998), Renewal Scheme for Enugu Urban. Case study of Ikirike in Enugu South L.G.A. of Enugu State. An unpublished B.Tech (URP) dissertation, dept of Urban and Regional Planning, FUT Minna
- Okeke, D. C (2002), Environmental and Urban Renewal Strategies. Theoretical and Analytical Frameworks. Institute for development studies UNEC Enugu.
- Onibokun, P & Agbola, T. (1986), Urban Housing Problems. Implications for the Land Use Decrees and Building Plan Approval Process in Onibokun, P. (ed) Urban Housing in Nigeria. Physical Planning dept, NISER Ibadan.
- Rothenberg, J. (1967), Economic Evaluation of Urban Renewal. Brooklyn Institution.
- Uchegbu, S.N. (2002), Environmental Management and Protection (2<sup>nd</sup> Ed) Spotlight Publishers Enugu
- World Bank et al (1995) in Ogundele O. T. (1996) Settlement Upgrading. A challenge to the Planners and Managers of Nigerian Cities in the 21<sup>st</sup> century. An unpublished paper presented at the 27<sup>th</sup> annual conference of NITP in Edo State 1996